



# Revolutionizing Education: Exploring The Impact of Gamification on Learning Outcomes

Ahmad Syawaluddin<sup>1\*</sup>, Marningot Tua Natalis Situmorang<sup>2</sup>, Ardhnari Hendra Kusuma<sup>3</sup>, Yanti Mulia Roza<sup>4</sup>, Ahsani Taqwiem<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1\*</sup>Universitas Negeri Makassar, Makassar, Indonesia Email: unmsyawal@gmail.com

<sup>2</sup>Universitas Sahid, Jakarta, Indonesia

<sup>3</sup>Poltekkes Kemenkes Jayapura, Indonesia

<sup>4</sup>UIN Mahmud Yunus, Batusangkar, Indonesia

<sup>5</sup>Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

**Citation:** Ahmad Syawaluddin et al. (2024), Revolutionizing Education: Exploring The Impact of Gamification on Learning Outcomes. *Educational Administration: Theory and Practice*, 30(5), 6604-6612

Doi: 10.53555/kuey.v30i5.3982

## ARTICLE INFO

## ABSTRACT

In the digital era, traditional approaches to education face challenges in maintaining student engagement and motivation. Gamification, which integrates game elements into the learning process, has emerged as a method that has the potential to change the way learning is conducted. This has the potential to increase student engagement as well as deepen understanding of complex subject matter. This research aims to explore the impact of gamification on learning outcomes and the development of students' social skills. This research uses a qualitative approach, with data collected from previous studies as well as phenomenological analysis of students' experiences. Data were analyzed using coding and interpretation methods to identify key themes in the use of gamification in education. The research conclusions show that gamification increases learning motivation, engagement in learning, and understanding of complex academic concepts. Gamification also contributes to the development of social skills such as cooperation and communication among students. However, challenges such as dependence on external incentives and gaps in technology access need to be addressed to optimize the implementation of gamification.

**Keywords:** Gamification, Learning Outcomes, Education, Educational Innovation, Educational Technology.

## A. INTRODUCTION

In the last decade, the world of education has faced various significant challenges that require new approaches to increase learning effectiveness. Technological transformation has brought new possibilities in designing curricula and teaching methods that are more interesting and interactive (Li et al., 2021). One of the main challenges faced by the education sector is the increasing need to make learning not only informative but also interesting and motivating for students. Student involvement in the learning process is now the main focus for educators and curriculum developers because this is closely related to improving learning outcomes and positive learning experiences (Szymkowiak et al., 2021).

In many countries, traditional education systems are often considered rigid and unable to meet students' individual needs. This can be seen from the way of teaching which tends to be one-way and has minimal interaction which can make students feel bored and disengaged. As a result, this creates problems in knowledge retention and application of knowledge in real life, thus demanding an innovative solution that can respond to changes and today's educational needs (Ladson-Billings, 2021).

The importance of adapting to changing educational needs is becoming increasingly urgent amidst global competition and the growing need for skills. Students' readiness to face real-world challenges after they graduate is an important indicator of the effectiveness of the education system. In this context, educators and stakeholders are trying to find methods that can increase learning motivation and educational outcomes (Yang et al., 2022).

Furthermore, demographic factors and diversity in classrooms also add complexity to teaching approaches. Students come with different backgrounds, unique learning styles, and varying ability levels. This requires the education system to be more flexible and adaptive in accommodating these differences to provide inclusive and effective learning experiences for all students (Alam & Mohanty, 2023).

On the other hand, the increasing availability of digital technology in the classroom provides new opportunities to implement more innovative teaching methods. Technology has proven to be a powerful tool in reaching a wider range of students and providing more diverse and interesting learning resources. However, the use of this technology has not been maximized, especially in integrating it into teaching strategies that can actively involve students in their learning process (Haleem et al., 2022).

Therefore, an approach is needed that does not only rely on traditional knowledge transmission but also utilizes strategies that can increase student motivation and participation. This will be critical in designing learning experiences that prepare students well for the needs of the 21st century, emphasizing not only knowledge but also social, critical, and analytical skills. This transformation must be able to address the various challenges faced in the classroom and turn them into rich and dynamic learning opportunities (Zidny et al., 2020).

Therefore, new approaches to education, which can respond effectively to all these challenges while improving student engagement and learning outcomes, are urgently needed. In the search for effective solutions, gamification has emerged as a promising strategy due to its ability to bring together essential educational elements in innovative and engaging ways. This is an important background in exploring the impact of gamification on learning outcomes in this research.

## B. LITERATURE REVIEW

### 1. Learning

According to Law No. 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System Article 1 Paragraph 20, the definition of learning is a process that involves interactions between students, educators, and learning resources that take place in a learning environment. Students are objects of education who receive knowledge teaching through the learning process to develop their abilities (Archambault et al., 2022). The knowledge received by students is taught by an educator, namely a professional staff whose job is to plan and operate the learning process, assess learning outcomes, and provide guidance and training to students. Meanwhile, all forms of tools and materials that can be used to provide knowledge to students and educators are called learning resources (Karim et al., 2021).

Ruhimat broadly states that learning is essentially an interaction between students and their learning environment to achieve learning goals. The learning objective in question is a change in student behavior which can be in the form of knowledge, attitudes, and even skills (Logayah et al., 2023).

Rusman describes learning as a system formed from several components that are interconnected with each other. These components consist of objectives, materials, methods, and evaluation. Educators as facilitators have an important role in managing these components. For example, educators must be skilled in determining and preparing the media, methods, strategies, and approaches that will be used in learning activities (Hujiboom et al., 2021).

**Learning is a system that has several components that are interconnected and influence each other. Ruhimat revealed several learning components as follows:**

#### a. Learning Objectives

Learning objectives are targets to be achieved after learning activities are carried out. This goal is part of efforts to achieve higher goals, namely educational goals and national development goals (Ferrer-Estévez & Chalmeta, 2021).

#### b. Learning Materials

Learning materials also often referred to as learning materials are a description of the curriculum content which is then packaged in the form of subjects or fields of study along with topics and details. In general, the content of the curriculum can be grouped into three main elements, namely: logic (knowledge of right and wrong), ethics (knowledge of good and bad), and aesthetics (knowledge of beauty) (Vinnervik, 2023).

#### c. Learning Strategy

Learning strategies are a series of steps used to achieve predetermined learning goals. In its implementation, learning strategies are very dependent on and cannot be separated from other components in the system. In other words, learning strategies are influenced by other factors such as objectives, materials, students, facilities, time, and educators (Mosqueira-Rey et al., 2023).

#### d. Learning media

Learning media are tools and materials that can help in conveying learning materials. Apart from that, according to Wirawan, learning media can also be used as an effort to improve students' learning activities.

Types of learning media can include visual media, audio media, audio-visual media, presenting media, and interactive media (Sudarmo et al., 2021).

### **e. Evaluation of learning**

Learning evaluation is a process carried out to obtain comprehensive information about the value of an object. In the learning evaluation process, it is not only based on measurement results but can also be based on observation results which then produce final value decisions about an object (Liu et al., 2021).

Based on the definition above, it can be concluded that learning is a form of interaction between components that occur in the learning environment. In general, learning components can include students, educators, objectives, materials, methods, and evaluation. Learning will occur if students can actively interact with learning resources arranged by educators (Müller & Mildenerger, 2021). Therefore, educators have an important role in managing and designing learning. If it can be implemented well, the learning objectives will be achieved. One of them is to change student behavior for the better and develop the knowledge, skills, and potential of students (Tamsah et al., 2021).

## **2. Gamification**

When you hear the word gamification, you can be sure that the first thing that comes to mind is the basic word gamification, namely game. According to Dhais Firmansyah, Gamification is the implementation of game components into other (non-game) knowledge domains, such as Points, Badges, Scoreboard, etc (Schöbel et al., 2020). According to Rahmatullah, Gamification is the process of using game elements that can be controlled in certain fields, especially in the field of education to make them more interesting, easy to understand, and creative, where game elements are related to motivation, participation, and achievement (Fiş Erümit et al., 2022).

Meanwhile, according to Jusuf, Gamification is a concept used in a game to motivate students to be able to think critically so they can solve problems in learning. Meanwhile, according to Sandusky, gamification means game design elements (for example scores and badges) are used in non-game contexts to encourage user interaction. This approach has been widely used, especially in the online business sector, as a strategy for offering a product or service (Suryani et al., 2024). For example, many online applications currently use a points system with various terms and conditions and are followed by promotional offers and benefits. Interested users or customers will automatically be motivated and more active in using the application to achieve the predetermined target points. This technique is similar to the elements in games, namely collecting as many points as possible to be able to proceed to the next level (Windasari et al., 2022).

Kapp describes gamification as the integration of game elements, aesthetics, and cognitive skills to capture attention, encourage motivation, enhance learning, and address challenges. Kapp categorizes gamification into two distinct types: structural gamification and content gamification. Structural gamification involves incorporating game mechanics to motivate learners without altering the actual content. In this approach, the content remains unchanged, merely adopting a game-like framework (Lampropoulos et al., 2022). This form primarily aims to engage users by motivating them with the content and engaging them in the educational process through a rewards system. On the other hand, content gamification involves the integration of game mechanics and algorithms to transform the content into something resembling a game. By infusing these elements, the content takes on a game-like appearance but does not become an actual game (Saleem et al., 2022).

Gartner describes gamification as the application of game mechanics and user experience design to digitally engage and motivate individuals to achieve their objectives. Mechanical elements refer to essential game components like points, leaderboards, and badges that facilitate progress within a game. User experience design, on the other hand, relates to the level of enjoyment and satisfaction a user or player derives from interacting with game elements (Kaur et al., 2023). The rationale behind using gamification digitally stems from the fact that the platforms for these games are digital devices such as computers, smartphones, and tablets. As a motivational tool, gamification seeks to alter habits, develop skills, or enhance an individual's creativity. Furthermore, according to Herger, gamification incorporates elements and techniques from various domains, including gaming, behavioral sciences, and motivational theory, to facilitate the understanding of a fundamental concept and further refine that concept (Comes et al., 2020).

Based on the description above, it can be concluded that gamification is an approach that utilizes mechanical elements from a game for other activities outside the game (non-game). The main goal of gamification itself is to increase someone's motivation interestingly so that it can help and make it easier for them to achieve certain goals. Gamification breaks down and divides a "big way" to achieve a goal into a simpler and more interesting form. If implemented well, this approach can provide great benefits in various fields, one of which is education (Friedrich et al., 2020).

## **3. Education Technology**

The terminology for the word "technology" comes from the Greek "technologia" which means handling something in a systematic way (systematic treatment). An expert named Donald P. Ely said that educational

technology is an area of education that includes a systematic identification process for maximizing the use of learning resources and organizing and developing various learning facilities. Another reference says that educational technology is a component of the education subsystem which has a role in problem-solving in the field of education (Tapalova & Zhiyenbayeva, 2022). Meanwhile, the Association for Educational Communication and Technology (AECT) views educational technology as an integrated and complex process involving ideas, procedures, equipment, personnel, and groups in analyzing a problem, looking for solutions to problem solving, implementing, managing, and evaluating all aspects related to aspects of human learning (Daya & Laher, 2020).

When viewed from its operational meaning, educational technology can be understood as a framework of methods with system construction in planning, using, and assessing all learning activities that focus on the interaction between humans and learning resources and techniques which culminate in the effectiveness of the desired educational format (Dong et al., 2020).

It is common to conclude that educational technology is a theory, field of study, and means, as well as a scientific discipline and ethical practice that aims to facilitate and provide access to the implementation of an integral learning process. Unification in this context is intended as integral support between elements that build the concept of educational technology itself, starting from the stage of analyzing educational problems, and finding solutions to these problems, which is continued with the evaluation stage of the management of the solutions carried out. This entire process is of course related to human learning activities through the use of learning resources and equipment that support aspects of education and learning (Marshall et al., 2022). The conclusion that the author can put forward from the various definitions above, boils down to the categorization of the scope of educational technology into four components, including: first, components that include design, development, utilization, management, evaluation, and research; second, components that include theory and practice; third, components which include systems, sources, and processes; fourth, components that include learning objectives (Susnjak et al., 2022).

### C. METHOD

This research will be carried out using a qualitative approach. Through this approach, research data will be obtained from various good sources such as research results and previous studies which still have relevance to the research content. Qualitative was chosen because it provides an in-depth and contextual understanding of the phenomenon under study, such as students' experiences and perceptions of the use of gamification in learning. This method allows researchers to explore various complex aspects of gamification in educational contexts in more detail and holistically. When the research data has been successfully collected, the research data will then be processed immediately, so that the results of this research can be found. The results of data processing will be used to compile accurate findings and conclusions and provide valuable insight into the influence and implications of gamification in education.

### D. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

#### 1. The Effect of Gamification on Learning Motivation

Gamification, as a learning approach that integrates game elements in an educational context, has shown great potential in increasing students' interest in learning material. Elements such as scores, levels, and achievements give students a clear insight into their progress and simultaneously inject a sense of urgency and excitement into a learning process that is often considered monotonous (Huang et al., 2020). The use of narrative and characters in gamification also helps make complex or less interesting material more relatable and interesting. For example, a difficult mathematical concept may be explained through a game that requires puzzle solving, where students must apply the concept to advance to the next level. This not only makes the learning process more engaging but also strengthens students' understanding as they see the direct application of what they learn in challenging and fun scenarios.

Furthermore, providing rewards and incentives in gamification plays a crucial role in influencing students' internal motivation. While external rewards such as medals, certificates, or points may spark initial interest, an important aspect of gamification is how it helps students develop intrinsic motivation to learn. This can be achieved by designing gamification activities that provide quick and constructive feedback so that students feel rewarded for their efforts. This way, students not only focus on the final prize but also enjoy the learning process itself. A well-designed achievement system encourages students to set their own goals and work towards achieving them, which is more intrinsically satisfying than simply receiving a reward.

However, it is also important to assess how gamification affects the sustainability of students' learning motivation in the long term. While gamification can effectively increase student engagement in the short term, the challenge is ensuring that this does not just become a temporary attraction. Educators must strategically design gamification elements so that they support the development of long-term motivation and learning independence (Santos-Villalba et al., 2020). This means that gamification must be more than just adding game elements; there must be deep integration with learning objectives so that students develop

sustainable learning habits even after the gamification elements are removed. This can be achieved by creating a balance between challenge and skill called the zone of proximal development, where students feel challenged enough to stay engaged but not too overwhelmed.

Thus, gamification approaches in education offer exciting opportunities to revolutionize the way students interact with learning materials. However, the success of this approach relies heavily on careful design and implementation that considers how to increase intrinsic motivation and ensure the sustainability of students' learning motivation. Through proper use, gamification can not only make learning more interesting but also more effective in forming students whose motivation is long-lasting and able to learn independently.

## **2. The Impact of Gamification on Student Engagement**

In the world of modern education, gamification has emerged as an invaluable tool for increasing student engagement. One of the most critical aspects of gamification is how it can facilitate greater interaction, not only between students but also between students and teachers. Through the use of game mechanics such as leaderboards, team missions, and challenges, students are allowed to collaborate and compete in a safe and structured environment (Poondej & Lerdpornkulrat, 2020). This naturally encourages dialogue and cooperation, not only among students trying to achieve a common goal but also with teachers who act as mentors or moderators in the game. For example, in a game designed for a history course, students might be divided into groups each representing a different country, with the teacher as an advisor who helps them understand the strategies and consequences of historical decisions. This fosters an environment where learning becomes more interactive and teachers can more easily assess student understanding in real-time.

Furthermore, gamification contributes significantly to creating immersive learning experiences, which is key to retaining students' attention and deepening their understanding. By integrating narrative, visual, and kinesthetic elements, gamification makes the learning process more like a story or journey than a routine task. When students 'get' into a game, they often forget that they are 'learning' in the traditional sense because they become too involved in solving the problem or achieving the goal put in front of them. This experience not only makes them more engaged but also more likely to retain the information and skills they have developed, because learning occurs in an engaging and relevant context.

Furthermore, an evaluation of the effects of gamification on the time students spend in learning activities shows positive results. Gamification tends to encourage students to invest more time both in class and outside of class. Because gamification elements can often be accessed through digital platforms, students can continue 'playing' and learning outside of school hours (Bai et al., 2020). This means that learning is no longer confined to the walls of the classroom; students can continue applying concepts and solving puzzles whenever they feel motivated to do so. By removing time and place constraints, gamification not only increases the amount of time spent learning but also helps students develop independent learning habits that will benefit them throughout life.

Thus, gamification has a significant and diverse impact on student engagement in the learning process. From facilitating more dynamic interactions between students and educators to creating immersive experiences, to increasing time spent learning, gamification is changing the way students interact with learning materials. Therefore, it is a tool that is not only fun but also very effective in contemporary education.

## **3. The Role of Gamification in Improving Learning Outcomes**

Gamification in education has been proven to be an effective strategy not only in increasing student engagement but also in improving their overall learning outcomes. Game elements applied in a learning context facilitate an environment where students feel more motivated and involved in exploring and understanding the material provided. One of the most prominent aspects of gamification is its ability to improve student academic achievement (Rivera & Garden, 2021). This occurs because gamification allows learning concepts to be presented in a more engaging and interactive format, which often results in increased retention of information and understanding of the material. When students face challenges in the form of games, they tend to be more invested in finding solutions and applying the knowledge they have learned, which can directly improve their scores and learning outcomes.

Furthermore, gamification plays a crucial role in helping students understand complex concepts more easily. Games often break down large, abstract concepts into smaller, more manageable parts, presented through levels or missions that must be completed. For example, in mathematics learning, concepts such as fractions can be divided into a series of puzzles that must be solved to progress to the next stage. This not only makes the material easier to digest but also allows students to apply concepts in a variety of contexts, strengthening their understanding through repeated practice. In this way, gamification reduces the frustration and anxiety that often accompanies learning challenging concepts and replaces it with a sense of accomplishment and entertainment.

Furthermore, gamification is also very effective in improving students' problem-solving and critical skills. Games often demand quick and adaptive thinking, encouraging students to develop and apply problem-solving strategies in dynamic situations. This is not only relevant in the context of the game itself but also trains students to apply similar skills in real-life situations (Aibar-Almazán et al., 2024). In addition, the

competitive elements often found in gamification can stimulate students to not only look for solutions but also to look for the most effective or efficient solutions. This fosters a deeper type of critical thinking, where students learn to assess alternatives and make decisions based on a careful assessment of the situation. Thus, gamification not only deepens academic understanding but also develops broader cognitive skills that will benefit students far beyond the classroom.

Thus, the role of gamification in education has proven to be invaluable in improving learning outcomes. Through increased academic achievement, ease in understanding complex concepts, and development of problem-solving and critical skills, gamification has redefined the way learning can be enhanced and implemented. This proves that effective learning involves not only absorbing information but also how that information is interacted with and applied, an aspect that is greatly strengthened through the use of gamification principles.

#### **4. Gamification and Social Skills Development**

In modern educational approaches, gamification has become a significant tool not only to increase engagement and learning outcomes but also to develop students' social skills. Through the clever design of game elements in the curriculum, gamification offers a unique opportunity to strengthen important social skills such as cooperation and communication. In many educational games, students are required to work in teams to complete missions or achieve a common goal (Campillo-Ferrer et al., 2020). This naturally encourages them to communicate effectively, listen actively, and collaborate to formulate strategies and make decisions together. This process not only strengthens relationships between students but also helps them practice and refine interpersonal skills that will be useful throughout their lives.

Furthermore, gamification also has an interesting impact on competitive and collaborative behavior among students. While some gamification elements encourage competition, such as high scores or rankings, many games are designed to balance this with a strong collaborative aspect. For example, games that require students to collaborate to complete puzzles or projects can teach them the important value of working as a team, even when they are also competing individually or in small groups. This allows students to experience the benefits of both types of social interactions—they learn when to compete and when to join hands with others. Such an approach helps students develop a balance between achieving personal excellence and working for the greater good of the group or team.

Furthermore, the use of gamification in education can also be an effective means of instilling values such as fairness and empathy. In games designed for education, stories, and scenarios are often included to mimic real-life situations in which students must make ethical decisions or consider the perspectives and emotions of others. For example, games that place students in the roles of various historical or fictional characters may ask them to navigate complex situations where their decisions can have far-reaching consequences for other characters. This encourages a deeper understanding of empathy and fairness, as students must consider the impact of their actions not only on themselves but also on others in the game. It instills a sense of social responsibility and helps students develop the ability to empathize with others in diverse and often challenging situations.

Thus, gamification is not only an innovative approach to education but also an invaluable tool for developing important social skills. By strengthening cooperation and communication, balancing competitive and collaborative behavior, and reinforcing values such as fairness and empathy, gamification demonstrates its potential as a powerful medium for fostering healthy social and emotional development among students.

#### **5. Challenges and Limitations of Gamification in Education**

While gamification in education offers many benefits and innovations, some significant challenges and limitations need to be addressed. One of the big challenges is the integration of gamification into existing curricula. Teachers often face difficulties in designing or adapting course materials to fit game elements without sacrificing the depth of academic content or rigorous educational standards (Piñero Charlo et al., 2022). This process requires not only creativity but also time and technological resources that may not always be available. Additionally, a lack of training or experience with gamification technologies and methodologies can make teachers feel awkward or unsure about implementing them effectively, which can reduce the overall effectiveness of a gamification initiative.

Furthermore, there are risks associated with reliance on the external rewards that gamification often promotes. Point systems, badges, and other forms of rewards can greatly motivate students to learn and participate in class activities. However, this can also cause students to focus more on obtaining those rewards rather than deeply understanding the material and internalizing the knowledge for personal satisfaction and intellectual development. When this external motivation becomes too dominant, it can be difficult to foster or maintain students' intrinsic motivation for learning, which is critical to their long-term success.

Additionally, gaps in access to technology are another major barrier to the effective implementation of gamification. Although digital technology is now more accessible than ever, there remain significant

differences in the availability and quality of technological equipment between educational institutions, especially between schools in rich and less well-off areas. This creates a gap in the quality of the learning experiences students receive. Students in environments with limited technological resources may not be able to take full advantage of the educational potential offered by gamification. This problem not only affects the effectiveness of gamification as an educational tool but also widens the educational gap in general.

Therefore, although gamification shows promise as an innovative learning strategy, its implementation must be managed carefully. There needs to be strategic planning, resource support, teacher training, and serious consideration of the psychological impact of this learning method. Also, efforts to reduce disparities in technology access must be increased to ensure that all students, regardless of their economic or geographic background, have an equal opportunity to benefit from this innovative educational approach.

## E. CONCLUSION

Gamification in education has shown significant potential in increasing learning motivation, student engagement, learning outcomes, and social skills development. By incorporating game elements into the curriculum, learning becomes more engaging and interactive, allowing students to engage more deeply with learning material and reinforce complex concepts. Gamification also improves students' academic achievement and problem-solving and critical abilities, while strengthening their social skills such as cooperation, communication, and empathy. However, implementing gamification is not without challenges. Limited resources, dependence on external rewards, and gaps in technology access are some of the barriers that need to be overcome. Strategic planning, infrastructure support, and adequate training for teachers are needed so that gamification can be successfully integrated into existing curricula. Therefore, although gamification offers a variety of benefits in educational contexts, a careful and well-considered approach is required to optimize its benefits and minimize any possible risks.

## REFERENCES

1. Aibar-Almazán, A., Castellote-Caballero, Y., Carcelén-Fraile, M. D. C., Rivas-Campo, Y., & González-Martín, A. M. (2024). Gamification in the classroom: Kahoot! As a tool for university teaching innovation. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 15, 1370084.
2. Alam, A., & Mohanty, A. (2023). Cultural beliefs and equity in educational institutions: exploring the social and philosophical notions of ability groupings in teaching and learning of mathematics. *International Journal of Adolescence and Youth*, 28(1), 2270662.
3. Archambault, L., Leary, H., & Rice, K. (2022). Pillars of online pedagogy: A framework for teaching in online learning environments. *Educational Psychologist*, 57(3), 178-191.
4. Bai, S., Hew, K. F., & Huang, B. (2020). Does gamification improve student learning outcome? Evidence from a meta-analysis and synthesis of qualitative data in educational contexts. *Educational Research Review*, 30, 100322.
5. Campillo-Ferrer, J. M., Miralles-Martínez, P., & Sánchez-Ibáñez, R. (2020). Gamification in higher education: Impact on student motivation and the acquisition of social and civic key competencies. *Sustainability*, 12(12), 4822.
6. Comes, R., Neamțu, C., Buna, Z. L., Bodi, Ș., Popescu, D., Tompa, V., ... & Mateescu-Suciu, L. (2020). Enhancing accessibility to cultural heritage through digital content and virtual reality: A case study of the Sarmizegetusa Regia UNESCO site. *Journal of Ancient History And Archaeology*, 7(3).
7. Daya, A., & Laher, S. (2020). Exploring the influence of educators' access to and attitudes towards educational technology on the use of educational technology in Johannesburg schools. *Africa Education Review*, 17(1), 159-180.
8. Dong, Z. Y., Zhang, Y., Yip, C., Swift, S., & Beswick, K. (2020). Smart campus: definition, framework, technologies, and services. *IET Smart Cities*, 2(1), 43-54.
9. Ferrer-Estévez, M., & Chalmeta, R. (2021). Integrating sustainable development goals in educational institutions. *The International Journal of Management Education*, 19(2), 100494.
10. Fiş Erümit, S. E. M. R. A., & Karakuş Yılmaz, T. (2022). Gamification design in education: What might give a sense of play and learning?. *Technology, Knowledge and Learning*, 27(4), 1039-1061.
11. Friedrich, J., Becker, M., Kramer, F., Wirth, M., & Schneider, M. (2020). Incentive design and gamification for knowledge management. *Journal of Business Research*, 106, 341-352.
12. Haleem, A., Javaid, M., Qadri, M. A., & Suman, R. (2022). Understanding the role of digital technologies in education: A review. *Sustainable Operations and Computers*, 3, 275-285.
13. Huang, R., Ritzhaupt, A. D., Sommer, M., Zhu, J., Stephen, A., Valle, N., ... & Li, J. (2020). The impact of gamification in educational settings on student learning outcomes: A meta-analysis. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 68, 1875-1901.
14. Huijboom, F., Van Meeuwen, P., Rusman, E., & Vermeulen, M. (2021). Professional learning communities (PLCs) as learning environments for teachers: An in-depth examination of the development of seven PLCs and influencing factors. *Learning, Culture and Social Interaction*, 31, 100566.

15. Karim, A., Kartiko, A., Daulay, D. E., & Kumalasari, I. D. (2021). The Effect of The Supervision of The Principal and The Professional Competency of Teachers on Teacher Performance in Private MI in Pacet District. *Nidhomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 6(3), 497-512.
16. Kaur, J., Lavuri, R., Parida, R., & Singh, S. V. (2023). Exploring the impact of gamification elements in brand apps on the purchase intention of consumers. *Journal of Global Information Management (JGIM)*, 31(1), 1-30.
17. Ladson-Billings, G. (2021). I'm here for the hard re-set: Post pandemic pedagogy to preserve our culture. *Equity & Excellence in Education*, 54(1), 68-78.
18. Lampropoulos, G., Keramopoulos, E., Diamantaras, K., & Evangelidis, G. (2022). Augmented reality and gamification in education: A systematic literature review of research, applications, and empirical studies. *Applied Sciences*, 12(13), 6809.
19. Li, Q., Li, Z., & Han, J. (2021). A hybrid learning pedagogy for surmounting the challenges of the COVID-19 pandemic in the performing arts education. *Education and Information Technologies*, 26(6), 7635-7655.
20. Liu, Y., Sun, P., Wergeles, N., & Shang, Y. (2021). A survey and performance evaluation of deep learning methods for small object detection. *Expert Systems with Applications*, 172, 114602.
21. Logayah, D. S., Maryani, E., Ruhimat, M., & Wiyanarti, E. (2023). Understanding Disaster Literacy Level in Indonesia: How can students understand natural disasters?. *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 15(4), 4962-4971.
22. Marshall, R., Pardo, A., Smith, D., & Watson, T. (2022). Implementing next generation privacy and ethics research in education technology. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 53(4), 737-755.
23. Mosqueira-Rey, E., Hernández-Pereira, E., Alonso-Ríos, D., Bobes-Bascarán, J., & Fernández-Leal, Á. (2023). Human-in-the-loop machine learning: a state of the art. *Artificial Intelligence Review*, 56(4), 3005-3054.
24. Müller, C., & Mildenerger, T. (2021). Facilitating flexible learning by replacing classroom time with an online learning environment: A systematic review of blended learning in higher education. *Educational Research Review*, 34, 100394.
25. Piñero Charlo, J. C., Belova, N., Quevedo Gutiérrez, E., Zapatera Llinares, A., Arboleya-García, E., Swacha, J., ... & Carmona-Medeiro, E. (2022). Preface for the special issue "trends in educational gamification: challenges and learning opportunities". *Education Sciences*, 12(3), 179.
26. Poondej, C., & Lerdpornkulrat, T. (2020). Gamification in e-learning: A Moodle implementation and its effect on student engagement and performance. *Interactive Technology and Smart Education*, 17(1), 56-66.
27. Rivera, E. S., & Garden, C. L. P. (2021). Gamification for student engagement: a framework. *Journal of further and higher education*, 45(7), 999-1012.
28. Saleem, A. N., Noori, N. M., & Ozdamli, F. (2022). Gamification applications in E-learning: A literature review. *Technology, Knowledge and Learning*, 27(1), 139-159.
29. Santos-Villalba, M. J., Leiva Olivencia, J. J., Navas-Parejo, M. R., & Benítez-Márquez, M. D. (2020). Higher education students' assessments towards gamification and sustainability: A case study. *Sustainability*, 12(20), 8513.
30. Schöbel, S. M., Janson, A., & Söllner, M. (2020). Capturing the complexity of gamification elements: a holistic approach for analysing existing and deriving novel gamification designs. *European Journal of Information Systems*, 29(6), 641-668.
31. Sudarmo, S., Arifin, A., Pattiasina, P. J., Wirawan, V., & Aslan, A. (2021). The Future of Instruction Media in Indonesian Education: Systematic Review. *Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 13(2), 1302-1311.
32. Suryani, H., Setiani, A., & Agustiani, N. (2024). Gamification of Mathematics Teaching Materials to Improve Problem Solving and Critical Thinking Ability: The Experts' Assessment. *Educational Administration: Theory and Practice*, 30(4), 819-833.
33. Susnjak, T., Ramaswami, G. S., & Mathrani, A. (2022). Learning analytics dashboard: a tool for providing actionable insights to learners. *International Journal of Educational Technology in Higher Education*, 19(1), 12.
34. Szymkowiak, A., Melović, B., Dabić, M., Jeganathan, K., & Kundi, G. S. (2021). Information technology and Gen Z: The role of teachers, the internet, and technology in the education of young people. *Technology in Society*, 65, 101565.
35. Tamsah, H., Ilyas, J. B., & Yusriadi, Y. (2021). Create teaching creativity through training management, effectiveness training, and teacher quality in the covid-19 pandemic. *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Studies*, 8(4), 18-35.
36. Tapalova, O., & Zhiyenbayeva, N. (2022). Artificial intelligence in education: AIED for personalised learning pathways. *Electronic Journal of e-Learning*, 20(5), 639-653.
37. Vinnervik, P. (2023). An in-depth analysis of programming in the Swedish school curriculum—rationale, knowledge content and teacher guidance. *Journal of Computers in Education*, 10(2), 237-271.
38. Windasari, N. A., Kusumawati, N., Larasati, N., & Amelia, R. P. (2022). Digital-only banking experience: Insights from gen Y and gen Z. *Journal of Innovation & Knowledge*, 7(2), 100170.



- 
39. Yang, Q., Shen, J., & Xu, Y. (2022). Changes in international student mobility amid the COVID-19 pandemic and response in the China context. *Fudan Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences*, 1-18.
  40. Zidny, R., Sjöström, J., & Eilks, I. (2020). A multi-perspective reflection on how indigenous knowledge and related ideas can improve science education for sustainability. *Science & Education*, 29(1), 145-185.